



# **CITY OF ERIE FINAL AUDIT REPORT**

---

**SEPTEMBER 2019**



## Table of Contents

Candidate Information .....	3
Audit Findings .....	4
Compliance .....	8
Audit Action Plan.....	12
Additional Criteria and Scoring .....	13
Your Certified Welcoming Score .....	14
Appendix A: Certification Worksheet .....	15
Appendix B: Audit Details.....	39



## Candidate Information

CERTIFICATION STATUS	Candidate
NAME OF LOCAL GOVERNMENT	Erie
TYPE OF GOVERNMENT	City
TYPE OF ASSESSMENT	Initial Audit
CONTACT PERSON	Name: Niken Astari Carpenter Organization: Mayor's Office, City of Erie Email/Phone Number: <a href="mailto:nastari@erie.pa.us">nastari@erie.pa.us</a> 814-870-1200
APPLICABLE STANDARD	Welcoming Standard 1.0
OBJECTIVE	Evaluation of local government's compliance with the criteria in the Welcoming America Standard.
ASSESSMENT TEAM	Auditor(s): Melissa Bertolo and JJ Kriehbel Analyst(s): Melissa Bertolo and JJ Kriehbel
AUDIT DATE	July 10-12, 2019
REPORT DRAFTED BY REPORT APPROVED BY	Melissa Bertolo, Certified Welcoming Manager Meg Shoemaker Little, Chief Program Officer



## Audit Findings

The following tables provide a brief overview of audit findings in each of the framework areas of the Welcoming Standard along with the four key strategies we apply to each of the framework areas. For additional information regarding the audit findings, please see Appendix A, Certification Worksheet for both highlights and observations related to the criteria.

### Framework Areas

GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP	<p>The commitment of the City of Erie to immigrant inclusion and welcome is noteworthy. The City has taken a number of initial steps to move this work forward. Since much of the work is still fairly nascent, we expect it to continue to move forward and be institutionalized prior to recertification. The Refugee &amp; Immigrant Liaison position stood out as a critical link to the New American community and stakeholders recognized Niken Astari Carpenter as a key resource in the City of Erie. Creating a New American's Council also demonstrates the City's commitment to hearing directly from New Americans.</p> <p>Opportunities to deepen government leadership work include formalizing staff time dedicated to immigrant welcome, formalizing its welcoming plan, and identifying measures of success across departments.</p>
EQUITABLE ACCESS	<p>Equitable Access is an opportunity for growth for Erie. The local government has not prioritized language access and its use of children as interpreters for parents or other family members navigating government systems and services is a grave concern.</p> <p>The use of feedback loops to identify barriers to accessing services for New American populations appears to be primarily focused on the refugee population. Ensuring cross-sector partnership, and identifying and addressing barriers for all immigrants, regardless immigration status, is an opportunity for growth for Erie. Access to legal services is a critical area of growth.</p> <p>Programming related to accessing housing and health care services, including mental health, are highlights for Erie.</p>
CIVIC ENGAGEMENT	<p>While Erie meets the core criteria for civic engagement, civic engagement is still an area of opportunity for Erie. Ensuring all residents, including newcomers, fully participate in civic life by increasing access to leadership and</p>



	<p>democratic spaces is a critical aspect of welcoming communities. Ensuring partnership programs address barriers to civic engagement that New Americans may face is an important component to ensure they are accessible. Leadership development programs for immigrants and refugees is also critical need.</p> <p>The City's and community partners' commitment to the naturalization ceremonies is noteworthy. The Facebook livestreaming of the ceremonies is an innovative way to amplify support. Additional support throughout the naturalization process is an area of opportunity for Erie.</p>
CONNECTED COMMUNITIES	<p>Erie's efforts to build relationships and work on issues of common interest through the People's Suppers is noteworthy. As the People's Suppers have concluded, finding opportunities to sustain connections between newcomers and longer-term residents and work on issues of common interest will be an important strategy to implement in order to maintain compliance with the Welcoming Standard.</p> <p>Building relationships with the Latinx community and the undocumented community are an area of growth for Erie.</p>
EDUCATION	<p>Partnership programs providing educational support to immigrant students and families are a highlight. Programs of the Multicultural Community Resource Center (MCRC) to achieve equitable educational outcomes for immigrant students and of Greater Erie Community Action Committee (GECAC) to ensure individuals are prepared to enter the workforce are highlights.</p>
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT	<p>Economic development is a strength and area of growth for Erie. Mosaico is an innovative solution to supporting employment for immigrant jobseekers.</p> <p>While business development services and programs have created products that are immigrant friendly, ensuring immigrants are aware of the products through education and outreach is an on-going opportunity for growth.</p> <p>Employer engagement is an area of growth for Erie, as is integrating feedback from immigrant residents into economic development planning and programs.</p>



SAFE COMMUNITIES	Safe Communities is both an area of strength and opportunity for Erie. The Strengthen Police and Community Partnerships Council (SPCPC) is a highlight with its clear focus on building positive community-police relations and addressing issues of concern of the community and council. Its engagement of other jurisdictions is also noteworthy. Further engagement of fire and code enforcement is an area of growth.
	Providing Know Your Rights (KYR) education directly to immigrants, in addition to service providers and allies, is an area of growth for Erie.
	Language access is an area of growth for departments covered under Safe Communities.

## Strategies

RECEIVING COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT	Receiving community engagement is both a strength and area of growth for Erie. As mentioned in the Connected Communities section above, the People's Suppers demonstrate a strong commitment from the receiving community. Ensuring continued partnership and collaboration between affinity groups, and not just within, will be a critical milestone for Erie.
	The receiving community primarily connects with refugees and expanding into the immigrant community, particularly the Latinx and undocumented community, is an area of critical growth.
PARTNERSHIP	Partnership is a strength for Erie, with a number of community organizations stepping in and up to ensure immigrants and refugees are supported in the community. Although welcoming work is new for the City of Erie, community partners and stakeholders clearly value their relationship with the Mayor's Office.
	MCRC is worth highlighting as a community partner that has continued to fill gaps and ensure all residents have access to services, particularly in a community faced with resource challenges.



<b>EQUITY, DIVERSITY, AND INCLUSION</b>	<p>The City of Erie has made a commitment to equity, diversity, and inclusion; although, there is still work to be done to ensure all residents feel welcomed and have equitable opportunity.</p> <p>The Mayor’s Office has prioritized communication with residents through its weekly press conferences and use of Facebook live. The Summer of Hope door knocking campaign and use of interpreters also demonstrates a commitment to inclusion and ensuring all voices are heard.</p> <p>Ensuring welcoming and immigrant integration is included throughout the City of Erie’s equity, diversity, and inclusion work is an area of growth.</p> <p>Erie Arts and Culture’s commitment to cultural equity is also a highlight.</p>
<b>GOAL SETTING, MONITORING, AND IMPACT</b>	<p>As much of Erie’s work is in its nascent stages, we did not observe much monitoring or evaluation. As the work continues to develop, ensuring immigrant inclusion metrics are developed is an area of critical growth for Erie.</p>



## Compliance

To meet certification requirements, you must meet at least 91% (41/45) of the core criteria in the Welcoming Standard. The City of Erie currently meet 69% (31/45) of the core criteria. The following tables provide an overview of your compliance with the core criteria in the Welcoming Standard. Detailed information on compliance, including highlights and observations, can be found in the Certification Worksheet, included as Appendix A.

Should you disagree with any decision regarding compliance with the Welcoming Standard, you may file an appeal. Please note, you must submit a completed appeal form within 10 business days of receiving your Final Audit Report. The appeal form and instructions are available online at [www.certifiedwelcoming.org](http://www.certifiedwelcoming.org) or <https://www.tfaforms.com/4663366>. A decision regarding your appeal will be made within 20 business days of receiving the appeal.

## Core Criteria

Category	Total Core Criteria	Complied	Non-complied
GOVERNMENT LEADERSHIP	10	7	3
EQUITABLE ACCESS	10	5	5
CIVIC ENGAGEMENT	3	3	0
CONNECTED COMMUNITIES	7	5	2
EDUCATION	2	2	0
ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT	4	4	0
SAFE COMMUNITIES	9	5	4
OVERALL COMPLIANCE	45	31	14





## List of Non-Compliant Core Criteria

Category	#	Requirement/ Indicator	Description	Evidence of Non-Compliance
Government Leadership	GL4	Requirement	A program is in place to manage a community-wide plan for immigrant inclusion.	The People's Summit provided only recommendations at the time of the audit, which does not constitute a plan.
Government Leadership	GL4.1	Indicator	The program includes processes to regularly assess the needs and priorities of the local immigrant community in each of the categories of this standard and use that feedback to strengthen the plan.	While it is assumed the New American Council will meet this role, the Council had not yet met or been given directive at the time of the audit.
Government Leadership	GL4.2	Indicator	The program includes processes to engage cross-sector and diverse stakeholders in the maintenance and implementation of the plan, including stakeholders from the immigrant community and receiving community.	While it is assumed the New American Council will meet this role, the Council had not yet met or been given directive at the time of the audit.
Equitable Access	EA2	Requirement	A program(s) is in place to ensure language access across government agencies with the goal of expanding equitable access to programs, services, and activities.	No evidence provided.



Equitable Access	EA2.1	Indicator	The program(s) assesses and addresses language needs for accessing important community information including safety services and emergency and alert systems.	No evidence provided.
Equitable Access	EA2.2	Indicator	The program(s) includes training for staff.	No evidence provided.
Equitable Access	EA3	Requirement	A process(es) is in place to identify barriers to equitable access to programs and services, and develop partnership programs to address those barriers.	See EA 3.2 - all core indicators must be met in order for core requirements to be considered compliant.
Equitable Access	EA3.2	Indicator	Partnership programs to achieve equitable access address fraudulent services and scams targeting the immigrant community.	Insufficient evidence provided.
Connected Communities	CC2	Requirement	A partnership program(s) is in place to promote a welcoming culture through communications activities across diverse media and communications platforms.	See CC 2.1 All core indicators must be met for core requirements to be considered compliant.



Connected Communities	CC2.1	Indicator	The local government has a public proclamation or resolution declaring itself to be a welcoming community.	No evidence provided.
Safe Communities	SC1	Requirement	A program(s) exists to train public safety staff on working with diverse populations	See SC 1.1 All core indicators must be met for core requirements to be considered compliant.
Safe Communities	SC1.1	Indicator	The program(s) includes training for staff operating emergency response systems under the jurisdiction of the local government	No evidence of Fire/EMS training was provided.
Safe Communities	SC3	Requirement	A partnership program(s) is in place to educate immigrants about their rights and responsibilities under the law.	See SC 3.2 All core indicators must be met for core requirements to be considered compliant.
Safe Communities	SC3.2	Indicator	The partnership program(s) includes information on relevant local codes.	Although presentations have occurred in the past, they have not occurred in some time and there are not clear plans to begin implementing presentations again.



## Audit Action Plan

The City of Erie meets 69% (31/45) of the core criteria of the Welcoming Standard, which means the City of Erie must create and implement an Audit Action Plan up to at least 91% or 41 of the 45 criteria to receive a provisional certificate, valid for up to one year. The full certificate will be awarded once Erie meets 100% of the Welcoming Standard. To access the Audit Action Plan and instructions, please visit <https://www.tfaforms.com/4663326>.

You are expected to create the Audit Action Plan within 30 business days of receiving this report. You are expected to implement and fulfill the requirements in the Audit Action Plan within 6 months of its approval. If additional time is needed, please contact Melissa Bertolo or Meg Shoemaker Little at [certified@welcomingamerica.org](mailto:certified@welcomingamerica.org). If you do not complete the Audit Action Plan within the time frame approved, the City of Erie may be subject to sanctions, including decertification.



## Additional Criteria and Scoring

Compliance with additional criteria is not required for certification. Additional criteria are used to encourage continuous improvement, as demonstrated through an increased score. Your Certified Welcoming Score is generated by averaging the number of points you received for *additional criteria*. Points for core criteria are not included in this score as they are used to determine your certification. Your Certified Welcoming Score captures a useful snapshot of strengths and opportunities for improvement beyond meeting the core criteria. Scores set a baseline by which to define improvement during recertification, but are not required to increase for recertification. In the future, we anticipate communities will be able to use their scores to compare local welcoming efforts to national averages.

For a full list of points assigned to each criterion, see Appendix A, the certification worksheet or [Appendix A in the Standard Operating Procedure](#).

## Scoring

All criteria— core and additional, requirements and indicators— have assigned points. The points system takes into account the impact of the criteria, the resources required to implement the criteria (in other words how accessible a criteria is to cities and counties regardless of budget, population, jurisdiction, and other factors), and whether the criteria is core or additional. Points for requirements range from 101 to 200 with all core requirements receiving 200 points. Indicator points range from 1 to 100 with all core indicators receiving 100 points.



## Your Certified Welcoming Score

Category	Additional Criteria Total	Additional Criteria - Complied	Total Possible Points	Total Points Achieved	Score
Government Leadership	10	2	665	40	6.0
Equitable Access	14	5	1278	495	38.7
Civic Engagement	6	1	443	105	23.7
Connected Communities	3	0	140	0	0.0
Education	9	5	470	232	49.4
Economic Development	13	2	809	51	6.3
Safe Communities	3	0	324	0	0.0
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>58</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>4129</b>	<b>983</b>	<b>23.81</b>





## Appendix A: Certification Worksheet

**Explanation of Highlights:** During the audit process, our team identified particularly innovative or effective programs and strategies that set Erie apart in its pursuit of the Welcoming Standard. Welcoming America would like to engage your team around the possibility to amplify, share, and learn more about these practices.

**Explanation of Observations:** During the certification process, our team identified opportunities for growth and improvement, which are described in the observations column. When applying for recertification, your certification team will assess how observations for core criteria have been addressed. In order to become recertified, observations must sufficiently be improved. If you would like to discuss any of the observations, please contact your certification team at [certified@welcomingamerica.org](mailto:certified@welcomingamerica.org).

Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
Government Leadership (GL)							
GL1	Requirement A policy is in place that designates a unit focused on immigrant inclusion work.	Core	200	✓			
GL1.1	Indicator The unit is formalized, active, and has dedicated staff.	Core	100	✓			The work of the Immigrant & Refugee Liaison is considered additional to the overall job and is not formalized through a job description. Institutionalizing this work is expected for recertification.



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
GL1.2	Indicator The unit's governance includes multi-sector representation, and representatives reflect the diversity of the immigrant community and the receiving community.	Additional	60		While it is assumed the New American Council will meet this role, the Council had not yet met or been given directive at the time of the audit.		
GL2	Requirement The unit advances immigrant inclusion through partnership and collaboration across community sectors and government agencies.	Core	200	✓			
GL2.1	Indicator The unit engages other jurisdictions on immigrant inclusion especially those jurisdictions that have impact on the policies and programs included in this standard.	Core	100	✓			Engaging other jurisdictions around all immigrants, not only refugees, is expected for recertification.
GL2.2	Indicator The unit supports local government agencies in setting goals for immigrant inclusion and monitoring progress toward those goals.	Additional	90		Insufficient evidence provided.		





Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
GL3	Requirement A program(s) is in place to provide information on community services.	Core	200	✓			
GL3.1	Indicator The program(s) provides information on government resources such as local government services and public benefits.	Core	100	✓			
GL3.2	Indicator The program(s) provides information on English language learning opportunities.	Core	100	✓			
GL3.3	Indicator The program(s) provides information on naturalization.	Additional	20	✓			
GL3.4	Indicator The program(s) provides information on professional licensing and starting a business.	Additional	20	✓			
GL4	Requirement A program is in place to manage a community-wide plan for immigrant inclusion.	Core	200		The People's Summit provided only recommendations at the time of the audit, which does not constitute a plan.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
GL4.1	Indicator The program includes processes to regularly assess the needs and priorities of the local immigrant community in each of the categories of this standard and use that feedback to strengthen the plan.	Core	100		While it is assumed the New American Council will meet this role, the Council had not yet met or been given directive at the time of the audit.		
GL4.2	Indicator The program includes processes to engage cross-sector and diverse stakeholders in the maintenance and implementation of the plan, including stakeholders from the immigrant community and receiving community.	Core	100		While it is assumed the New American Council will meet this role, the Council had not yet met or been given directive at the time of the audit.		
GL4.3	Indicator The program includes accountability and learning mechanisms to regularly assess the effectiveness of activities outlined in the plan.	Additional	90		No evidence was provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
GL5	Requirement A program(s) is in place to promote and strengthen the capacity of Community Based Organizations working on immigrant inclusion.	Additional	112		Insufficient evidence provided.		
GL6	Requirement A program(s) is in place to promote employing a local government workforce that reflects the diversity of the community.	Additional	105		Although an impressive program to address diversity within the police department was described, it was not yet developed enough to meet this criteria. Evidence for other departments was not provided.		
GL6.1	Indicator The program(s) identifies and addresses barriers to inclusive hiring and employee retention including barriers to accessing information on open positions.	Additional	35		See GL 6		
GL7	Requirement A program(s) is in place to advance local and minority, including immigrant, owned business sourcing and contracting.	Additional	105		Insufficient evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
GL7.1	Indicator The program(s) identifies and addresses barriers to sourcing and contracting.	Additional	28		Insufficient evidence provided.		
Equitable Access (EA)							
EA1	Requirement No locally mandated government policies exist where the primary purpose of the policy is to exclude or disenfranchise immigrants.	Core	200	✓			
EA1.1	Indicator No locally mandated government codes exist where the primary purpose of the code is to exclude or disenfranchise immigrants.	Core	100	✓			
EA1.2	Indicator No locally mandated government policies exist where the primary purpose of the policy is to increase the rate of immigrant detention or deportation.	Core	100	✓			
EA1.3	Indicator No government policies exist where the primary purpose of the policy is to exclude or disenfranchise	Core	100	✓			



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
	immigrants based on other facets of their identity including gender, sexual orientation, race, ability, age, or religion.						
EA1.4	Indicator A process(es) is in place to regularly audit and improve local policies and codes to strengthen immigrant inclusion.	Additional	90		Insufficient evidence provided.		
EA2	Requirement A program(s) is in place to ensure language access across government agencies with the goal of expanding equitable access to programs, services, and activities.	Core	200		No evidence provided.		
EA2.1	Indicator The program(s) assesses and addresses language needs for accessing important community information including safety services and emergency and alert systems.	Core	100		No evidence provided.		
EA2.2	Indicator The program(s) includes training for staff.	Core	100		No evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
EA3	Requirement A process(es) is in place to identify barriers to equitable access to programs and services, and develop partnership programs to address those barriers.	Core	200		See EA 3.2 - all core indicators must be met in order for core requirements to be considered compliant.		
EA3.1	Indicator Partnership programs to achieve equitable access provide services that are responsive to diverse cultural practices, languages, and literacy levels.	Core	100	✓			
EA3.2	Indicator Partnership programs to achieve equitable access address fraudulent services and scams targeting the immigrant community.	Core	100		Insufficient evidence provided.		
EA4	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to achieve equitable access to health services for immigrants.	Additional	171	✓		The Multi-Cultural Health Evaluation Delivery System (MHEDS) is a highlight for its diverse staff and ability to serve patients in their home languages with culturally responsive care.	



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
EA4.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) provides information on health insurance options and promotes access to health insurance.	Additional	27	✓			
EA4.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes access to health services including treatment, testing, preventative health services, and mental health services.	Additional	63	✓		The mental health first aid training with the Nepalese community is a highlight.	
EA5	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to achieve equitable access to housing for immigrants.	Additional	171	✓		Erie Housing Authority's scope of services and accessibility to New Americans is a highlight.	
EA5.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes non-discrimination in housing regulations and tenant protections.	Additional	63	✓			
EA6	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to achieve equitable access to transportation for immigrants.	Additional	162		Insufficient evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
EA6.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes affordable transportation services and opportunities.	Additional	27		Insufficient evidence provided.		
EA7	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to achieve equitable access to justice for immigrants.	Additional	136		Insufficient evidence provided.		
EA7.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes access to justice in local court proceedings including access to legal advice.	Additional	64		Insufficient evidence provided.		
EA7.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes conflict resolution strategies such as mediation.	Additional	16		Insufficient evidence provided.		
EA8	Requirement A comprehensive language access policy is in place that cuts across government agencies.	Additional	171		No evidence provided.		





Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
EA8.1	Indicator The policy establishes a process(es) to identify essential government services and programs and prioritize language access to those services and programs.	Additional	81		No evidence provided.		
EA8.2	Indicator The policy includes training for staff on working with diverse populations.	Additional	36		No evidence provided.		
Civic Engagement (CE)							
CE1	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to develop immigrant knowledge of local government workings and advance immigrant civic engagement.	Core	200	✓			See CE 1.1
CE1.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) provides information on civic engagement opportunities along with general information on the responsibilities of local government.	Core	100	✓			Partnership programs providing civic education do not address specific barriers and challenges newcomers may face. Programming must be intentional in its design, outreach, and strategy for recertification.



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
CE1.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) supports immigrant participation in democratic spaces (i.e. hearings, council meetings).	Additional	50		Insufficient evidence provided.		
CE1.3	Indicator The partnership program(s) supports immigrant participation on commissions and boards, and advances immigrant civic leadership.	Additional	50		Insufficient evidence provided.		
CE2	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to support naturalization.	Core	200	✓		The City and community partners' enthusiasm for supporting the naturalization ceremonies is a highlight.	
CE3	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to support eligible immigrants in voting.	Additional	104		See CE 3.1 - all additional indicators must be met for additional requirements to be considered compliant.		
CE3.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) works with relevant local government and state agencies to identify and address barriers to voting for eligible immigrants.	Additional	28		Insufficient evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
CE4	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to engage immigrants in community service activities.	Additional	105	✓			
CE5	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to address the unauthorized practice of immigration law and related fraudulent services.	Additional	105		Insufficient evidence provided.		
Connected Communities (CC)							
CC1	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to nurture connections between the immigrant community and receiving community.	Core	200	✓			Building deeper relationships with the Latinx and undocumented community is expected.
CC1.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) brings the immigrant community and receiving community together to work on issues of common interest.	Core	100	✓			With the conclusion of the People's Suppers, continuing to bring people together to work on issues of common interest will be monitored for continued compliance.
CC1.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes regular interaction and communication between leaders in the immigrant	Core	100	✓			With the conclusion of the People's Suppers, ensuring regular communication and interaction between immigrant community



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
	community and leaders in the receiving community.						leaders and receiving community leaders will be monitored for continued compliance.
CC1.3	Indicator The partnership program(s) builds relationships between the receiving community and the immigrant community, and supports immigrants in building diverse personal networks.	Additional	80		Insufficient evidence provided.		
CC1.4	Indicator The partnership program(s) includes activities specifically targeted at connecting immigrant and receiving community youth.	Additional	30		No evidence provided.		
CC2	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to promote a welcoming culture through communications activities across diverse media and communications platforms.	Core	200		See CC 2.1 All core indicators must be met for core requirements to be considered compliant.	The City of Erie has prioritized communication with the community through efforts such as weekly press conferences and using Facebook live.	
CC2.1	Indicator The local government has a public proclamation or resolution declaring itself	Core	100		No evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
	to be a welcoming community.						
CC2.2	Indicator The local government does not make public statements discouraging immigration or immigrant inclusion.	Core	100	✓			
CC2.3	Indicator The local government does not make public statements directly attacking any community on the basis of their religion, ethnicity, race, gender, orientation, or ability.	Core	100	✓			
CC2.4	Indicator The partnership program(s) prioritizes messaging that communicates the community-wide benefit of immigrant inclusion and a welcoming culture for all residents.	Additional	30		Insufficient evidence provided.		
Education (ED)							
ED1	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to work with the primary and secondary school system(s) to attain	Core	200	✓			



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
	more equitable educational outcomes for immigrant students.						
ED1.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) advances immigrant parent engagement in schools and supports immigrant parents in navigating the education system (i.e. provides support with enrollment and information on local school options, resources available to students, and disciplinary procedures).	Core	100	✓		MCRC's community school liaisons are a highlight and demonstrate the organization's willingness to step in to fill gaps in an under-resourced community.	
ED1.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) facilitates immigrant student access to extracurricular or enrichment activities.	Additional	30	✓			
ED1.3	Indicator The partnership program(s) provides information on services such as counseling, financial assistance, and in-state tuition that increase immigrant student access to higher education.	Additional	40	✓			



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
ED1.4	Indicator The partnership program(s) provides career readiness support for immigrant students.	Additional	70	✓			
ED1.5	Indicator The partnership program(s) addresses early learning and primary school readiness for immigrant children.	Additional	70		No evidence provided.		
ED1.6	Indicator The partnership program(s) includes training for educators and staff on teaching and supporting diverse student populations.	Additional	50	✓			
ED2	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to advance educational and career opportunities for immigrant adults.	Additional	105		See ED 2.1 and 2.3 All additional indicators must be met for additional requirements to be considered compliant.		
ED2.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) facilitates access to professional development opportunities.	Additional	21		Insufficient evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
ED2.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) supports immigrant access to higher education, technical degrees, certification programs and professional licensing.	Additional	42	✓			
ED2.3	Indicator The partnership program(s) facilitates credentialing for immigrants.	Additional	42		Insufficient evidence provided.		
Economic Development (EC)							
EC1	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to support immigrant jobseekers.	Core	200	✓			
EC1.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) provides information and employment counseling to jobseekers such as information on job search resources.	Core	100	✓			
EC1.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) aims to prepare and place immigrants in jobs that pay a living wage and provide	Additional	70		Insufficient evidence provided.		





Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
	the potential for upward mobility.						
EC1.3	Indicator The partnership program(s) supports professional networking and mentorship opportunities.	Additional	30		Insufficient evidence provided.		
EC1.4	Indicator The partnership program(s) connects immigrants to work experience opportunities such as internships and apprenticeships.	Additional	30	✓			
EC2	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to engage local employers, chambers of commerce, and other employer networks in immigrant inclusion work.	Additional	105		See EC 2.2, 2.3, and 2.4 All additional indicators must be met for additional requirements to be considered compliant.		
EC2.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes workplace language learning opportunities.	Additional	21	✓			
EC2.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) works with employers to improve	Additional	21		Insufficient evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
	workplace conditions and culture.						
EC2.3	Indicator The partnership program(s) promotes the recognition of foreign work experience.	Additional	42		No evidence provided.		
EC2.4	Indicator The partnership program(s) works with businesses to identify and address discriminatory practices in hiring and employment.	Additional	49		No evidence provided.		
EC3	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to advance immigrants in starting, building, and growing businesses.	Core	200	✓			
EC3.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) provides information on enterprise development services.	Core	100	✓			
EC3.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) includes a process to regularly assess, identify, and address barriers for immigrant entrepreneurs	Additional	60		Although Erie has a number of services and loan products that are accessible to immigrants, no process to regularly assess and address barriers for immigrant		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
	and immigrant business-owners (i.e. access to contracting, financing, networking, and technical assistance opportunities).				entrepreneurs and business owners was identified.		
EC4	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to identify economic development needs and opportunities for immigrants.	Additional	105		No evidence provided.		
EC4.1	Indicator A process(es) is in place to integrate the findings of the partnership program(s) and immigrant inclusion best practice into the local government's formal economic development approach.	Additional	35		No evidence provided.		
EC5	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to strengthen immigrants' knowledge of the financial system and financial skills including avoiding predatory services and over-indebtedness.	Additional	105		Insufficient evidence provided.		



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
EC6	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to provide education on workers' rights and workplace safety, improve access to legal advice on employment and workplace issues, and address predatory practices targeting immigrant workers.	Additional	136		Insufficient evidence provided.		
Safe Communities (SC)							
SC1	Requirement A program(s) exists to train public safety staff on working with diverse populations.	Core	200		See SC 1.1 All core indicators must be met for core requirements to be considered compliant.		
SC1.1	Indicator The program(s) includes training for staff operating emergency response systems under the jurisdiction of the local government.	Core	100		No evidence of Fire/EMS training was provided.		
SC1.2	Indicator The program(s) includes law enforcement staff under the jurisdiction of the local government.	Core	100	✓			



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
SC1.3	Indicator The program(s) includes code enforcement staff under the jurisdiction of the local government.	Core	100	✓			At the time of the audit, training was only with manager-level staff. Training with field staff is expected for recertification.
SC1.4	Indicator The program(s) engages other jurisdictions whose public safety or emergency response systems impact local residents.	Core	100	✓		The work of the SPCPC engaging other law enforcement jurisdictions, including the state police, county sheriff, and District Attorney, is a highlight.	
SC2	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to strengthen relationships and promote regular communication between law and code enforcement agencies and the immigrant community.	Core	200	✓		The SPCPC is a highlight for bringing community members and police together to address issues of community concern.	Creating on-going communication with code enforcement is required for recertification.
SC3	Requirement A partnership program(s) is in place to educate immigrants about their rights and responsibilities under the law.	Core	200		See SC 3.2 All core indicators must be met for core requirements to be considered compliant.	Justice at Work's <i>Voces Project</i> is a highlight and best practice model for building trust and providing education to the immigrant community.	



Compliance Criteria				Certification Assessment			
#	Requirement/Indicator	Type	Points	✓	Evidence of non-compliance	Highlights	Observations
SC3.1	Indicator The partnership program(s) includes information on immigration law and enforcement.	Core	100	✓			Know Your Rights presentations have primarily been conducted with service providers and allies - not with immigrants themselves. Providing education directly to immigrants and refugees is expected in the future for recertification.
SC3.2	Indicator The partnership program(s) includes information on relevant local codes.	Core	100		Although presentations have occurred in the past, they have not occurred in some time and there are not clear plans to begin implementing presentations again.		
SC4	Requirement A policy(ies) is in place to provide safety services in a way that builds trust and relationships between the immigrant community and relevant agencies.	Additional	171		See SC 4.2 All additional indicators must be met for additional requirements to be considered compliant.		
SC4.1	Indicator The policy addresses victim services.	Additional	81		No evidence provided.		
SC4.2	Indicator The policy covers code enforcement.	Additional	72		No evidence provided.		



## Appendix B: Audit Details

Time	Name(s) of Interviewee(s)	Organization(s)	Framework Area
Wednesday, July 10, 2019			
8:30-9:00	Niken A Carpenter	City of Erie	Opening Meeting
9:00-10:00	Joe Schember, Mayor Renee Lamis, Chief of Staff Niken A Carpenter, Liaison to Refugee and Immigrant Michael Outlaw, Liaison to Community Aaron Loncki, Marketing & Special Events Coordinator Kathy Wyrosdick, Planning Director	City of Erie, Mayor's Office	Government Leadership
10:30 -11:30	Chris Groner, Director Veronica Fields, Assistant Grant Administrator Jennifer Hoffman, Business Development Officer	City of Erie, Economic and Community Development	Economic Development
11:30 -12:30	Michael Outlaw, Liaison to Community Police Chief Dan Spizarny Deputy Chief Mike Nolan Deputy Chief Jon Nolan Andy Zimmerman, Chief of Bureau (Code)	City of Erie, Fire Department, Police Department, Code Enforcement	Government Leadership Safe Communities
2:00 - 2:45	Ed Betza, City Solicitor Liz Allen, City Councilmember Kathy Schaaf, City Councilmember	City of Erie	Government Leadership Civic Engagement
3:00 - 3:45	Patty Stubber Alivia Haibach	MHEDS Erie County Health Dept	Equitable Access



	Denise Kolivoski Carrie Ennis Barbara Medilovic	NAMI Erie UMPC St. Vincent	
4:00-5:00	Sharman Khundker, Director Patrick Fisher, Director Kelly Armor	APAA Erie Culture and Arts	Connected Communities
6:30-7:30	Ben Speggen	Jefferson Civic Leadership Academy	Civic Engagement
Thursday, July 11, 2019			
9:00-10:00	Dylanna Grasinge Joe Haas Anna Tischenko Paul Jericho	IIE Catholic Charities MCRC	Economic Development Connected Communities Equitable Access
10:00-11:30	Refugee Collaborative Meeting		
11:30 -12:00	Shakila Shah Scott Rhodes Charlotte Fry	PA Dept of Human Services Bureau of Employment Programs Refugee Resettlement Unit	
2:00 - 2:45	Linda Cappabianca Ken Nickson Colin Hurley Seph Kumer	Erie Public School District  Mercyhurst University Gannon University	Education Civic Engagement Connected Communities
3:15 - 4:00	Leigh Kostis Art Leopold Sister Anne McCarthy Robert Rhodes	One Table, Welcome Table	Connected Communities Civic Engagement Safe Communities
4:00-5:00	Blane Dessy Sheryl Thomas	Erie County Public Library	Equitable Access Education





	Marcia Wilking Shane Donaldson Andrew Miller		
Friday, July 12, 2019			
9:00-10:00	Mike Fraley Representative for Jeremy Peterson	Erie Housing Authority EMTA	Equitable Access
10:00-11:00	Asuman Baskan Edie Cultu Corrine Egan Lori Dolan	AAUW Erie Branch  League of Women Voters	Education, Connected Communities, Civic Engagement
11:30	Joe Schember, Mayor Renee Lamis, Chief of Staff Niken A Carpenter, Liaison to Refugee and Immigrant Michael Outlaw, Liaison to Community Kathy Wyrosdick, Planning Director		Closing Meeting
Thursday, August 1, 2019			
1:30-2:00	James Grunke (Phone Call)	Erie Regional Chamber	Economic Development
10:00-10:30	Ben Wilson (Phone Call)	GECAC	Economic Development, Education
11:00-11:30	Fadhail Ibraheem (Phone Call)	Career Link	Economic Development, Education
11:30-12:00	Chanel Cook (Phone Call)	Idea Fund	Economic Development
Thursday, August 22, 2019			
2:00-3:00	Vanessa Griffith (Phone Call)	Justice at Work	Equitable Access, Connected Communities, Civic Engagement, Safe Communities